

► AN. CHUBARYAN, ARM. CHUBARYAN, H. NALBANDYAN,.

Department of Informatics and Applied Mathematics, Yerevan State University, 1 Alek Manoogian str., Yerevan 375049, Armenia.

*E-mail:* [achubaryan@ysu.am](mailto:achubaryan@ysu.am).

Department of Informatics and Applied Mathematics, Yerevan State University, 1 Alek Manoogian str., Yerevan 375049, Armenia.

*E-mail:* [chubarm@ysu.am](mailto:chubarm@ysu.am).

Department of Informatics and Applied Mathematics, Yerevan State University, 1 Alek Manoogian str., Yerevan 375049, Armenia.

*E-mail:* [hakob\\_nalbandyan@yahoo.com](mailto:hakob_nalbandyan@yahoo.com). We compare the proof complexities in Frege systems with different modifications of the substitution rule.

We use the generally accepted concept of Frege system, the well-known notions of proof complexities (size and lines) and the notion of polynomial equivalence (by size and by lines) of the proof systems.

Let  $\mathcal{F}$  be some Frege system. The substitution Frege system  $S\mathcal{F}$  consists of Frege system  $\mathcal{F}$  augmented with the substitution rule with inferences of the form  $\frac{A}{A\sigma}$  for any

substitution  $\sigma = \begin{pmatrix} \varphi_{i_1} & \varphi_{i_2} & \dots & \varphi_{i_m} \\ p_{i_1} & p_{i_2} & \dots & p_{i_m} \end{pmatrix}$ , where  $p_{i_j}$  ( $1 \leq j \leq m$ ) are the propositional variables,  $\varphi_{i_j}$  ( $1 \leq j \leq m$ ) are the propositional formulas, and  $A\sigma$  denotes the result of applying of the substitution  $\sigma$  to formula  $A$ . Such substitution rule allows to use the simultaneous substitution of multiple formulas for multiple variables of  $A$  without any restrictions. If the depths of formulas  $\varphi_{i_j}$  ( $1 \leq j \leq m$ ) are restricted by some fixed  $d$ , then we have  $d$ -restricted substitution rule and we denote the corresponding system by  $S^d\mathcal{F}$ .

We prove that

1) given arbitrary  $d_1 \geq 1$  and  $d_2 \geq 1$ , the systems  $S^{d_1}\mathcal{F}$  and  $S^{d_2}\mathcal{F}$  are polynomially equivalent (both by size and by lines),

2) given arbitrary  $d$ , the systems  $S^d\mathcal{F}$  and  $S\mathcal{F}$  are polynomially equivalent by size,

3) given arbitrary  $d$ , the minimal number of lines in a proof of tautology in  $S^d\mathcal{F}$  can be exponentially larger than in  $S\mathcal{F}$ .

The analogous results have been obtained by first two authors for  $k$ -bounded substitution rule, which for some fixed  $k$  allows substitution for any no more than  $k$  variables at a time.

The main difference between these two weak substitution rules is the following: for every  $k \geq 1$  Frege system with  $k$ -bounded substitution rule has exponential speed-up by lines over the Frege system, but for every  $d \geq 1$   $S^d\mathcal{F}$  and  $\mathcal{F}$  are polynomially equivalent by lines.